



## Ancient Eastern Scholars on State Governance

**Prof., Doctor of Sciences in Law, Djurabay Tashkulov**

**Head of Department, Institute of State and Law  
Academy of Sciences of Uzbekistan**

### ABSTRACT

From a historical and theoretical point of view, the article analyzes the views of the thinkers of the ancient East on public administration, the structure of society, forms and methods of public administration, based on the study of historical sources.

### Keywords:

History, state, ancient east, views of thinkers about the state, forms and methods of state administration, structure of society.

Ever since the evolution of humanity from the animal world, one of the most significant issues humanity had during the primitive society, tribes, and tribal union period and afterwards was the issue of correct and good governance. This matter built its significance during the emergence and development of the state. During the different stages of development, the issue of governance has been addressed in a variety of different ways. The reasons for that are a) the complex, multifaceted and large-scale nature of the state governance, b) the difficulty for a particular type of governance to match and meet the needs of all classes of the society, c) the essence, goals, functions and directions of the governance and the diversity of forms and means of exercising them, d) positive and negative attitudes towards these diverse forms and methods, e) the variety of approaches towards solving the governance-related issues: religious, secular, philosophical, rational, material, dialectical, fascistic, racist, cosmopolitan, political and other types of approaches, f) the overall development stage the people, the nation, the state are at; g) the level of political consciousness and political

culture, ethnic structure, diversity of belief and religion within the population, h) the distinct lifestyle, custom and traditions, i) the amount of experience, the achievements and flaws and deficiencies in the sphere of governance etc. Due to these reasons, during the historical development of the humanity miscellaneous types of governance have developed, from which the inefficient types have been replaced and efficient ones remained and further improved. In this process in states, the proportionality of different social-political forces and the essence of relations between them, the national lifestyle, custom and traditions, political-legal experience, the views, ideas, discussions on governance by supporters of the dominant ideology and the opposition played the significant role.

The initial ideas about state governance, its goals and functions, forms and methods were developed in the East. This is a natural occurrence because the emergence of state and law in the East is an undeniable event is a well-known fact. Therefore, special attention was paid to the views and discussions, proposals and recommendations about problems of

governance and solutions in the Ancient Eastern sources [1; 2; 3. –P.31-35.].

It is significant to note that the features of the social, economic, political, spiritual life of the Ancient Eastern nations considerably influenced the views and the reasoning on the solutions of problems of state governance. These features are the formation of slavery, usage of slaves primarily in domestic work, the insignificant role of slave labour in the production processes; the vast majority of the population consisting of free farmers; the authoritative position being held by state apparatus personnel, the people of the palace, wealthy nobles; people living in communities and lack of division to social classes; the strong influence of religious-mythical worldview on political views; the prevalence of divine characterization of the existing system, state power, and its orders (this is evident in their perception of kings, priests, judges, and other representatives of authority as descendants or vicegerents of God); political and legal views being of practical importance, the main focus being on the art of governance, the mechanism of exercise of state power and ensuring the fair trials; the government of the state leader being considered as equal to the government of the state; the strong connection of political and legal thoughts to the ethics, majority of thinkers believing that the improvement or change of public administration can be achieved by improving or changing the moral qualities of members of society, with a special focus on the issue of moral education [1; 2; 3. –P.31-35.].

The uprisings in the Ancient East were aimed at restoring justice, reducing taxes, removing some tyrannical officials, transferring power from one dynasty to another and redistributing material wealth; they were not aimed at changing the economic and political foundations of society, general issues of concept, origin, essence and form of the state and law in the political and legal doctrines of the region, but rather focusing on practical issues (requirements to the head of state, its responsibilities to its citizens, the defence of the country, etc.), the political and legal ideology being complex and contradictory, which could be proven by the formation of trends that

represent and protect the interests of some social-political forces, as well as the sharpening of the ideological struggle between them. It should also be noted that in addition to the above-mentioned general features of the political and legal thought of the ancient East, there are also specific features of the political and legal thought of the individual regions.

In the sources of the ancient East, strengthening the order and discipline established on earth, which is considered as an integral part of the order and discipline established in the whole universe and space, which plays a crucial role in achieving well-being and happiness, is highly associated with the art of governance, the ideas and thoughts on the organization of governance at the highest level is emphasized [4].

The initial ideas on governance in Ancient Egyptian sources were stated in "Admonition". Practical instructions are given there to heads of state on how to organize and exercise governance. In the "Admonition" of the king of Heracleopolis to his son, in the XXI century BC, the king instructs his son to rely on the nobility and the military to rule the country, to support the nobles materially and spiritually, to be forgiving to their relatives, to be cruel and to take strict measures against the rebels, to refrain from excessive cruelty to the subordinates, to protect the weak and feeble, not to be unjust in the application of punishments, recommends that the death penalty should not be used, but instead to choose corporal punishment or imprisonment. The king told his son: "Introduce the truth and you will live long in this world. ..., do not oppress the widow, do not persecute the son of man for the property of the father". According to researchers, the ideas about the means and methods of governance in "Admonitions" were put forward in order to create a centralized state [3; -C.31-35].

In order to achieve this goal, the King gave several instructions to his son: to involve young people in the service, to get a majority of recruits of his age (over 20 years old) among his supporters, to take care of the supply and enrichment of government officials, increase the number of your own guards or warriors, treat

the son of a nobleman the same as the son of an ordinary citizen, keep the people who serves well and sincerely close to you, keep the state borders well-guarded, be generous to increase your supporters, give gifts to people, show them due respect, be compassionate to weak, powerless citizens, who are unable to pay taxes and so on. The king recommends his son: "You should know that the king is ... You should serve as an example to people with the effort you put. This way, you can increase your status" [3. -P. 31-35.].

The minister of one of the pharaohs of the 5th dynasty ruling the ancient Egypt, stated in his "Maxims of Ptahhotep" that the behavior of each person should be in accordance with his place and position in society, and that those of lower status should be subordinate, obey to those of higher status, especially to respect the leaders, the chiefs, not to persecute the person to whom the ruler has appealed, to unconditionally follow the established discipline and not to abuse power[5. -P.238-255].

One of the sources of the Ancient East that the humanity inherited, the Avesta, not only contains remarkable ideas for its time, but also it is a significant source to refer to in contemporary days. According to researchers, the Zoroastrian teachings formed in Khorezm and gradually spread to Gava (Sogdiana), Mouru (Margiyana), Bakhti (Bactria), Nisa (Parthia), Harayva (Herat), Voiha-Girta (Kabul), Avrava (Tus), Xninta (Gurgan), Hirmand (Gilmand), Ray (present-day Tehran suburbs), Chahra (Khorasan), Varina (south of the Caspian Sea), Haftrud (beginning of the Indian River - Punjab region), Ranha (Ganga river bank), Mesopotamia (modern-day Syria and Iraq), ancient Babylon and Assyria, the Arabian Peninsula, Asia Minor (modern-day ancient Byzantium), and even ancient Greece and Rome (modern-day Italy), after which these teaching effected the religious beliefs, secular ideology, spirituality, science, statehood, socio-political system of the peoples living in those areas[8; -P.79-80.]. The Avesta is a comprehensive, multifaceted, comprehensive source that contains guidelines and ideas on social, economic, political, religious, legal, spiritual,

educational, moral and other issues and their solutions[4].

In Avesta, politics, government and law are the key issues. In particular, it focuses on questions related to the ideological foundations and practical aspects of governance. The central idea of Avesta is the conflict between good and evil. This conflict manifests itself in all spheres of social life and ultimately ends in the victory of goodness. The three pillars of goodness are good thoughts, good words, and good deeds. The realization of this trinity is a guarantee of the victory of goodness. So people, including rulers and leaders, have to fight for this trio to become a reality. In order to do this, rulers shall be kind to those who live and adhere to the rules of Ahura Mazda, the creator of the world of truth and goodness, the cause and protector of all pure, good, positive deeds in the universe, they shall not withhold from helping those who need help, shall be always ready to fight against evil forces and vices, shall spare no effort for the happiness of his fellow believers and compatriots, shall live, work, cooperate in harmony and friendship, shall strive for the triumph of truth and justice, and to be selfless in the cause of peace, stability and prosperity. In this regard, Avesta states: "I give glory for the good words and good deeds"[4].

It is emphasized in Avesta that the most important condition for the victory of good over evil, for the triumph of truth and justice, is the unconditional and unwavering adherence to the laws of Ahura Mazda. To do this, it is necessary to ensure the priority of good ideas, good words, good deeds at all levels of government.

Pursuant to Avesta, governance is carried out at the following levels: family "damana", huge family community "nmanapati", ... "vis", huge village "vispati", tribe "zantupati", district "varzanapati", the country is ruled by a "kavy". The highest authority in the country is in the hands of the "varzanapati" - the Council of Elders and "vyaha" - the People's Assembly. A respected wise member of the Council of Elders has the authority of a supreme judge[4].

According to Avesta, in the relations between people in general, including relations with rulers, obedience to the law, fidelity, fulfillment of promises, carrying out the

obligations in good faith, honesty, truthfulness, supporting justice, humanity, patriotism, wishing well to others, cooperation, the ethical and legal principles should play a leading, coordinating role.

The happiness of the people, according to Avesta, depends in many ways on the upbringing of the rulers, on the faithful service of their people, and on the perfect application of just laws. Avesta says, "Let good rulers rule by implementing the doctrine of goodness and devotion. Let them carry out just laws that bring happiness to the people and their descendants".

The governance of the country must be carried out by a wise ruler who relies on reason, justice and the legislators of Ahura Mazda. Only then can the country demolish violence, injustice, cruelty, ambition, slander and jealousy, end wars, conflicts, and achieve peace, stability, prosperity, cooperation, justice, truth and friendship thrive within the country[4].

The first thoughts and ideas about governing a community, a state, a country can be found in the sources of Ancient India. It should be noted that the issue of governance at that time clearly was defined by and closely connected to the division of society into castes (varna) – division to social classes, their immutability and eternity, the role and place of each caste in socio-political life. The political and legal sources of ancient India - the laws and treatises - emphasize the dominance of the divine law - rita, vrata, dharma and custom (dharma, dharman) in socio-political life[6].

In particular, the idea that the members of society were created by God in four varnas was first mentioned in the "Rig Veda" (a collection of religious rituals) and is reflected in the "Atharva Vedda", the "Yajur Vedda", and other sources. The Rig Veda also has a varna system and two powers based on the division of responsibilities between the varnas; The idea of brahman - spiritual authority and the kshatriya secular authority- king - was put forward. According to these sources, rulers were created by God and chosen by man. That is why the issue of obligations towards the citizens is raised in Yajurved and other sources.

In the sources, it is stated that the members of the society are divided into four

varnas - Brahmans, Kshatriyas, Vaishyas and Shudras; that the Brahmans were created from the mouth of the god, the Kshatriyas from the hands of the god, the Vaishyas from the waist, and the shudras from the lower part of the foot; that the Brahmans are the priests, the Kshatriyas are the military, the Vaishyas are the peasants, the herdsmen, the Shudras are the lowest class of society, that Brahmans shall study Vedas, lead prayers and rituals and provide the nation with religious education, Kshatriyas shall lead military activities, and representatives of these two varna shall lead governmental and social affairs. The Vaishyas are engaged in tillage, cattle-raising and trade. Shudras serve the above mentioned three varnas. Although the Shudras are officially free people, their situation is almost no different from that of slaves.

In ancient India, two major directions of political and legal ideology - Brahmanism and Buddhism were formed. The main sources of Brahmanist ideology are the Manu Laws and the Artkhashastra treatises. According to Manu's laws, the subjugation of the whole universe can be achieved through punishments. The basic method of governance according to the teachings of the Brahmins is coercion. Where there is no coercion, there is no discipline. State power is the rule of a leader on the basis of one-ruler principle. For any well-organized state, the following seven elements are inherent: the ruler, the adviser, the country, the castle, the treasury, the army, and the allies. The most important of these elements is the ruler. But the ruler must rule the state under the leadership of the priests. This indicates that the adherents of the ideology of Brahmanism advocated the supremacy of religious authority over secular authority, that is, the theocratic monarchy of governing the state[7].

The treatise Artkhashastra was written by Cautilus, an adviser to Chandragupta who was the ruler who founded the powerful Mauryan kingdom in the 4th century BC. Artkhashastra discusses the need to enforce dharma laws through harsh punishments, the superiority of Brahmans over other varnas, and the fact that "as the student obeys his master, so the ruler must obey the priest of the palace." In contrast

to other sources, Artkhashastra promotes the idea of the supremacy of the rule of law, the source of secular law, over religious law in socio-political life. Author of the treatise. Such a strong centralized monarchy is in favor of the author of the treatise. Another difference of Artkhashastra from other sources is that its main focus is not on substantiating the divinity of royal authority, but on practical advice in the field of public administration[2; -P.17-18].

The treatise states that each class must abide by rules relevant to them, exercise their rights and fulfill their obligations. In addition to the rules that determine the behavior and actions of each class, there are rules that are common to all.

No matter what class you belong to you must adhere to the rules on non-violence, honesty, purity, forgiveness, patience and avoiding jealousy. The ruler must not allow any living being to violate the laws he has established. Lawlessness is one of the main causes of the crisis, the failure of governance. Legitimacy is a key guarantee of successful governance.

One of the important conditions for the proper organization and successful implementation of governance is that the ruler does not give into the emotions. An emotional ruler is a victim of his own emotions, no matter who he is. In order for a ruler to overcome his emotions, he must get wise by consulting and communicating with scholars, to find out the truth through spies, to control his emotions, to have exemplary knowledge in various fields of science, to increase the wealth of citizens, to do good to them, to create good living conditions in order to gain the respect and affection of the people[2. -P.21].

Governing a country is a complex and difficult task that only one person cannot manage in its entirety. Therefore, the ruler should take counselors and consult with them to organize and carry out the supervision. The role of ministers in government is unique. A ministerial position is a complex and responsible one. Therefore, a person who is well known by the ruler and able to carry out the task assigned to him can be appointed a minister. Only people with noble blood, who are wise,

truthful, courageous and loyal deserve such a position. People with such qualities should be selected and appointed as ministers. But the minister will not be an adviser[2. -P.23-24].

The best advisers to the ruler are the chief counselor and the palace priest. The chief consultant should be from the local population, can easily control rizvat, master of his profession, wise, possesses strong memory, agile, eloquent, confident, responsive, talented businessman, entrepreneur, courageous, truthful, intelligent, loyal, stable, having good intentions, healthy, handsome, not stubborn and light-hearted, pleasantly appealing. Such qualities are determined by the ruler through trustworthy people, experts, attitude to work, speech, conversation, behavior in difficult situations, communication and personal meeting. The ruler as a priest of palace appoints people who are highly well-behaved, have studied deeply the Vedas and six additional subjects, governance of the state, who can withstand the calamities caused by gods and men by magic and other means.

An important condition for the proper organization and implementation of governance is that a ruler has a clear and accurate knowledge of the situation on the districts, the attitude of different classes of the population, groups and individuals to his domestic and foreign policies. Based on such information, the right decisions can be made. To do this, the ruler must have reliable spies of various kinds in cities, villages, markets, and other places where people gather. With their help, to acquire relevant information, to materially and morally encourage those who have a positive attitude to his policy, to do good to those who have a negative attitude, to give them gifts, to argue with them, to subdue them by punishing them. It should also take steps to identify those who are prone to betrayal in secret and turn them to their side.

Another important condition for the proper organization and implementation of governing the country is the activeness of the ruler in this regard. If the ruler is not active, one cannot expect others to be like that. Inactivity leads to the failure of any good work started.

Thinkers and philosophers who lived and worked in Ancient China played a big role in the formation and development of ideas about state governance. Unlike the ancient Indian thinkers, the ancient Chinese thinkers emphasized the role of man, not the role of God (astronomy) in governing the state. They expressed their opinions about the personal characteristics, knowledge, practical experience, moral and spiritual qualities of the head of state and his staff in state administration. The opinions expressed by Confucius on these issues deserve special attention[1].

Ancient Chinese thinker, political figure, philosopher, ethicist, founder of Confucianism. Confucius had not only theoretical knowledge in the field of public administration, but also enough practical experience. He went through the ranks of the service from ordinary officials to the ministry of the Lu principality, and in the last years of his life he established his own school.

Confucius is recognized by the world scientific community as one of the thinkers and political figures who left an indelible mark in the history of human culture with his knowledge, wisdom and socio-political activity.

In general, according to the teachings of Confucius, there is no such thing, event, phenomenon in this world whose essence cannot be explained. A person is able to understand their essence. For this, a person must have sufficient knowledge and experience.

In this regard, it should be noted that Confucius was not interested in the creation of the universe, its essence, the life after human death, the afterlife, heaven, and hell. Confucius said: "how to serve spirits without serving people". The main focus of the thinker is man, his life in this world, what he should do to live a good life, the role and place of the state in ensuring a good and prosperous life of citizens, and finding solutions to such problems as establishing the best state and organizing its governance.

The main goal of Confucius is to educate people in the spirit of respecting and following the rules in practice. According to Confucius, society is governed by the law of "Jen" (humanity) sent by the heavens. In order to

deeply understand the essence of this law, to strictly comply with its requirements, the members of the society must unconditionally follow the "Lee" - moral norms and rules, the rules of conducting traditional ceremonies passed from generation to generation, their position, place, role, ability, knowledge in society, should work according to experience[1].

One of the important issues raised in the scientific legacy of Confucius is the issue of the state's purpose, mission and organization of its governance. It should be noted that the thinker's views on the state are based on his philosophical and moral teachings.

Confucius puts forward the idea that changes in the state system, its internal and external policies, state governance methods are the product of people's active efforts. The basis of the positive results of human efforts in this regard lies in their unwavering adherence to the rules of ethics.

According to Confucius, the main task of the state, first of all, of its head, is to ensure the peace of its citizens, feed them, enrich them, educate them, and take necessary measures for their education.

According to the teachings of Confucius, the method of managing the state is of great importance in ensuring the fulfillment of the duties of the state and its leader. If the governance of the state is based on violence, such a state and its leader cannot fulfill the task set before it. Reliance on coercion in governance causes popular discontent, revolts and uprisings. On the contrary, managing the state using methods that are not based on violence increases the trust and respect of the people to the state and its head, and to the representatives of the authorities in general: "Why govern the state to kill people? If you strive for good, then the people will be kind"[1].

In the governance of the state, according to Confucius, the head of state plays an important role. Managers below him - ministers, local officials, follow the example of the head of state and fulfill their duties. In this regard, the head of the state should be an example to his subordinates in diligently fulfilling the duties assigned to him, taking care of citizens, justice,

humanity, generosity, faithfulness to the traditions of ancestors, kindness, and goodness.

Confucius states that the head of the state can strengthen his power by being kind, caring, generous and good to his citizens, gaining their trust and respect: "Achieve the love of the people, and you will receive power", "If a virtuous sovereign owns the means, then he owns the country"[1].

Confucius put special emphasis on instilling in the minds of his contemporaries the idea that it is necessary to rely on high moral rules in governance. To strive for moral improvement, according to the thinker, is the civic duty of every person. It is impossible to establish strict discipline in the country without getting the members of the society to fulfill their civic duty diligently. Therefore, it is the main duty of the head of state to take necessary measures related to the organization of moral education of citizens. In order to perform this duty smoothly, the head of state should have high moral qualities and be an example for his officials and citizens in the performance of his activities.

An important condition for establishing strict discipline in society, according to the philosopher, is the clear definition of the place and role of each member of society in social life, as well as obligations.

Everyone should act, strive, work and perform their activities based on their place, role and position in society and the obligations assigned to them: "Otets doljen byt ottsom, syn doljen byt synom, pravitel doljen byt pravitelem". "Father should be father, son should be son, ruler should be ruler".

Confucius was not in favor of the implementation of the state governance based on the laws defining the punishment measures. It is not possible to educate and re-educate citizens in the spirit of strict adherence to the established order in the country by threatening them with punishment. Threatening violators with punishment instills in them a hatred of the established order, and they become intolerant. «If you govern by laws and enforce order by punishment, people will try to avoid punishment, but will not feel shame; if, however, to rule with help and ensure order with the

ritual, people will have shame and become honest and sincere»[1].

It is not possible to ensure peace, tranquility and stability in the country by punishing citizens. Therefore, the main focus should not be on punishing the violators, but on educating and re-educating them. The first and main place of nature is the family. A person who has received a good upbringing in the family will never violate the order established in the country, will not resist the authorities, will not rebel:

"There is no rebellion in people who know their filial duty and listen to the advice of adults. Your Excellency, man thinks of his offspring; if the root is strong, the path will be smooth. Isn't that the root of humanity?"[1].

In Confucius, who believed that education should begin at a young age in the family. "Children who have received good education in the family respect their parents at home, listen to adults on the street, are careful and fair, love everyone and are close to kind people. If they have the opportunity, they strive to learn science. Such children will never become disorderly.

In order to win the love of his people, the head of state must respect the traditions of the people, conduct a fair policy, stick to the truth, and fulfill his duties honestly and diligently: "If the ruler loves the traditions, the people will not disrespect him; if the ruler loves justice, the people will not turn to impurity"[1].

Based on the above, the thinkers of the ancient East defined state management as justice, mutual trust between the state and the people, humanity, legality, the rule of law, guaranteeing the rights of the state's citizens, taking care of them, protecting people's lives, health, property and interests. The ideas of implementation based on protection, etc., made a worthy contribution to the formation and development of the political and legal doctrines of the peoples of the world. The ideas put forward by them in the field of public administration played an important role in the enrichment and development of views and opinions related to the field in the Middle Ages and later in the East and West.

The foundations of state management by Eastern thinkers, including requirements for the head of state, his ministers, advisers and other officials in state management, evaluating their performance, solving problems based on the general interest in state management, knowledge in this regard, experience accumulated by ancestors, the culture of each nation - their opinions about the implementation of measures based on their customs and traditions are important not only for the period in which they lived, but also today, and have not lost their relevance. In this regard, to carry out in-depth and comprehensive scientific research on the views of the ancient Eastern thinkers and their followers on the state and law, scientific analysis of their views in this field in comparison with the views of Western thinkers, and as a result of the comparative analysis, the views of the Eastern and Western thinkers on the state and It is the demand of the time to determine the common, similar and different aspects characteristic of their views on law, to develop suggestions and recommendations about the solution of the problems of the state administration today based on the conclusions drawn from them.

Implementation of the abovementioned ideas requires the establishment of cooperation of scientific staff conducting research on the history of the doctrines of the state and law of the East and the West, holding international conferences on important issues related to the field, co-authoring monographs, textbooks and training manuals and publishing them in the languages of the peoples of the world.

Based on the above, thinkers of the ancient East defined that state governance relies on justice, mutual trust between the state and the people, humanity, legality, the rule of law, guaranteeing the rights of the state's citizens, taking care of them, protecting people's lives, health, property and interests, and by this they made a worthy contribution to the formation and development of the political and legal doctrines of the nations of the world.

The ideas put forward by them in the field of public administration played an important role in the enrichment and development of views and opinions related to

the field in the Middle Ages and later in the East and West.

The foundations of state governance analyzed by Eastern thinkers, including requirements for the head of state, his ministers, advisers and other officials in state governance, evaluating their performance, solving problems by relying on the public interest, knowledge in this regard, experience accumulated by ancestors, the culture of each nation - their opinions about the implementation of measures based on their customs and traditions are important not only for the period in which they lived, but also today, and have not lost their significance.

It is hereby crucial to carry out in-depth and comprehensive scientific research on the views of the ancient Eastern thinkers and their followers on the state and law, scientific analysis of their views in this field in comparison with the views of Western thinkers, and as a result of the comparative analysis, the views of the Eastern and Western thinkers on the state and It is the demand of the time to determine the common, similar and different aspects characteristic of their views on law, to develop suggestions and recommendations about the solution of the problems of the state administration today based on the conclusions drawn from them.

Implementation of the above requires the establishment of cooperation of scientific staff conducting research on the history of the doctrines of the state and law of the East and the West, holding international conferences on important issues related to the field, co-authoring monographs, textbooks and training manuals and publishing them in the languages of the peoples of the world.

#### References:

1. The analects of Confucius. William Edward Soothill. 1910 // [https://archive.org/details/theanalects\\_ofcon00soothoft](https://archive.org/details/theanalects_ofcon00soothoft)
2. Artxashastra ili nauka politiki. Perevod s sanskrita. Izdanie podgotovil V.I.Kal'yanov. Izd-vo AN SSSR, Moskva-Leningrad, 1959. -800 p.;



3. Pouchenie Gerakleopol'skogo sarya svoemu sinu Merikara //Xrestomatiya po istorii Drevnego Vostoka: Uchebnoe posobie v 2-x chastyax. Ch 1. / pod red. M.A. Korostovseva, I.S.Kasnel'sona, V.I.Kuzishina. M.,«Visshaya shkola», 1980. -P.31-35
4. The Zend-Avesta part i the Vendidad translated by james darmesteter Sacred Books of the East, Volume 4. Oxford University Press, 1880. {scanned at sacred-texts.com January-May/2001 //https://ar.islamforchristians.com/wp-content/uploads/The-Avesta.pdf
5. Pouchenie Ptaxxotepa / per. i komm. Kamneva O. A. // Drevniy Vostok i antichniy mir. Trudi kafedri istorii Drevnego mira istoricheskogo fakul'teta MGU. Vip. 5 / otv. red. I. A. Gvozdeva. — M.: EkoPress-2000, 2002. — C. 238-255.
6. <https://www.holybooks.com/wp-content/uploads/RigVeda.pdf>
7. Zakoni Manu. Perevod S.D.El'manovicha. Proverenniy i ispravlenniy G.F.Il'inim. "Nauka" - glavnaya redaksiya Vostochnoy literaturi nauchno-izdatel'skiy sentr "Ladimir" Moskva, 1992. // <https://prepod.nspu.ru/mod/page/view.php?id=6638>;
8. Boboev X.B. Xasanov S. «Avesto» ma'naviyatimiz sarchashmasi. -T.: «Adolat», 2001. -P. 79-80